



T-PCHC MINUTES

The Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission (T-PCHC) met in the City Attorney's Conference Room, City Hall, 7th floor, 255 West Alameda, Tucson, Arizona, at 12:05 p.m. on Wednesday, September 9, 2009.

1. **Call to Order / Roll Call**

Members Present:

Teresita Majewski, Chair	Carlos Lozano
Norma Niblett, Vice Chair	Bettina Lyons
Annette Campbell	Kathy Nabours
Sharon Chadwick	Sybil Needham
Demion Clinco	Patsy Waterfall
Stephen Grede (departed @ 1:15 p.m.)	Gal Witmer
Albert Guidero	
Sarah Herr	
Joe Joaquin (departed @ 1:25 p.m.)	
Gerald Juliani	

Members Absent:

Sandee Brooke
Bill Mackey
Estevan Rodriguez
Renee RedDog
Eileen R. Warshaw

Others Present:

Jonathan Mabry	Historic Preservation Officer, COT Urban Planning & Design
Linda Mayro	Cultural Resources Manager, Pima County Cultural Resources and Historic Preservation Office
Irene Ogata	Office of Community Services Department
Aline Torres	Historic Preservation Office
Kathryn Hahne	Landscape Advisory Committee
Corky Poster	Poster Frost Associates, Inc.
Diana Rhoades	Vice Mayor Regina Romero's Office, Ward 1
Paula Smith	Landscape Advisory Committee
Megan Neighbor	Arizona Daily Star
Randy Van Nostrand	President, Valley of the Moon
Charley Butler	Valley of the Moon
Ken Scoville	Citizen
Sylvia Carbajal	Recording Secretary, City of Tucson City Clerk's Office

Approved: 10/14/2009

2. Election of Chair and Vice Chair

Nominations were requested from the floor for Vice Chair.

Sara Herr nominated Norma Niblett for Vice Chair.

There were no other nominations. Motion by Sharon Chadwick, duly seconded, and carried by a voice vote of 16 to 0 to close the nominations.

By unanimous consent (Commissioners Brooke, Mackey, RedDog, Rodriguez, and Warshaw absent), Norma Niblett was elected as Vice Chair.

Nominations were requested from the floor for Chair.

Sybil Needham nominated Terry Majewski for Chair.

There were no other nominations. Motion by Sharon Chadwick, duly seconded, and carried by a voice vote of 16 to 0 to close the nominations.

By unanimous consent (Commissioners Brooke, Mackey, RedDog, Rodriguez, and Warshaw absent), Terry Majewski was elected as Chair.

3. Consent Agenda

- A. Approval of Minutes of July 8, 2009
- B. Approval of Budget Subcommittee Actions from meeting of:
 - 1. September 9, 2009
- C. Approval of Plans Review Subcommittee Actions from the meeting(s) of:
 - 1. July 9, 2009
 - 2. July 23, 2009
 - 3. August 13, 2009

It was moved by Commissioner Nabours, duly seconded, and carried by a voice vote of 16 to 0 (Commissioners Brooke, Mackey, RedDog, Rodriguez, and Warshaw absent) to approve Consent Agenda Items A, B, and C.

4. Chairperson's Summary of Current Events

No report was given.

5. Removal/Appointments to Committees and to T-PCHC Subcommittees

No report was given.

6. Reports from City and County Staff

A. City of Tucson Historic Preservation Officer (Jonathan Mabry)

1. An update was given on the cultural resources component of the Modern Streetcar Project. The work will include the first inventory of National Register-eligible buildings along the 4th Avenue Commercial District corridor. The consultant for the project is Poster Frost. The work will also include an inventory of downtown buildings eligible for the National Register, and archaeological testing along Granada Avenue. As the project goes forward, there will be consultations with the State Historic Preservation Office about the design and locations of the streetcar stations in relation to historic buildings.
2. The Historic Landmark Signs Ad Hoc Subcommittee had their first meeting. Dr. Mabry said there was a lot of interest in the community and with the Mayor and Council to go forward on the preservation and restoration of Historic Landmark Signs in the City. He said Commissioner Lozano would report on the meeting under a separate item.
3. The Historic Sites Review Committee would meet on October 9, 2009. Expansion of the Menlo Park National Register District and the Villa Catalina National Register Nomination are two of the items on the agenda.
4. A report was given on an emergency situation on the condition of the Charles O. Brown House on Broadway. The building was located at rear of Jackson Street and was the oldest standing building in the City. The Arizona Historical Society had been renting it to El Centro Cultural de Las Americas. The rear building in the corner was collapsing, and one of the interior walls was badly eroding. Dr. Mabry said he was working with the Arizona Historical Society and the City to get emergency stabilization funding to make needed repairs.
5. An update was given on a similar situation at the Marist College building. The tarps that were put in place in 2005 need to be replaced, and the roof needs repairs. Dr. Mabry said he had been working with the diocese to arrange emergency stabilization funding from the City. The diocese will come up with a partial match for funding.

B. Pima County Cultural Resources Manager (Linda Mayro)

1. Existing Bond Program Updates:
 - a) Dunbar School - The rehabilitation of the exterior was about to go to construction. The contract had been awarded and was scheduled to begin within thirty days.
 - b) Canoa Ranch – Plans for permitting were in for the next phase of the building's exterior rehabilitation. Plans were scheduled to go out to bid within the next thirty to sixty days.

- c) Ajo Depot Transportation Enhancement Grant – Update was given.
- d) Valencia Site Acquisition Meeting was scheduled September 11, 2009, with State Parks Board for grant they qualified for.
- e) Fort Lowell Plan – Update was given. Corky Poster was scheduled to come back to the Commission within next few months, then to Mayor and Council.
- f) Steam Pump Ranch – Work was continuing.

- 2. Update was given on future bonds. Pima County was scheduled to hold a Bond Committee meeting on September 11, 2009, for future bond elections. Ms. Mayro reported on a list of recommendations for historic preservation bond projects that would be discussed by the Pima County Bond Committee. She stated the county administrator had to reduce every program significantly.
- 3. A brief update was also given on the Walgreens building, Mission Gardens, and the Santa Cruz Valley National Heritage Area Bill.
- 4. An update was given on the proposed nomination of the Rillito Race Track as the J. Rukin Jelks Stud Farm Historic Site. A copy of the draft summary sheets for the nomination was distributed to Commissioners, and Commissioner Chadwick agreed to review the entire nomination and provide comments to Ms. Mayro prior to the Historic Sites Review Committee meeting in October.

C. Tucson Department of Transportation Director (Jim Glock or TDOT Staff)

No report was given.

7. **T-PCHC Subcommittee/Other Committee and Task Force Status Reports**

A. T-PCHC Plans Review Subcommittee (Terry Majewski)

No report was given.

B. T-PCHC Rules and Regulations Subcommittee (Sandee Brooke)

No report was given.

C. T-PCHC Transportation Subcommittee (Sharon Chadwick)

No report was given.

D. Downtown Links Citizens Advisory Committee (Gerald Juliani)

No report was given.

- E. Downtown Neighborhoods and Residents Council (Sarah Herr or Terry Majewski)

Chair Majewski reported that the council did not meet in September, and the next meeting was scheduled for October. She stated the council was planning a neighborhood Town Hall in November.

- F. T-PCHC Birthday Celebration Subcommittee (Kathy Nabours)

Commissioner Nabours reported on Tucson's 234th Birthday Celebration held August 20, 2009. She thanked everyone who was able to attend. She reported the Birthday Subcommittee met and discussed suggestions for future celebrations.

Chair Majewski thanked the Subcommittee, staff, and everyone who attended. She expressed regrets that she was unable to attend, as she was out of the country.

- G. Historic Landmark Signs Ad Hoc Subcommittee (Carlos Lozano)

Commissioner Lozano reported the subcommittee had their first meeting, where they discussed the mission and scope of the subcommittee. They also reviewed the draft concept. Two business owners gave short presentations on efforts they made to restore historic signs and the problems encountered. He stated the subcommittee would work on removing encumbrances that the Sign Code had created for restoration of historic signs.

8. Proposed City Land Use Code Amendment Requiring Architectural Documentation of Historic Properties Prior to Demolition (Jonathan Mabry)

Jonathan Mabry reported an ordinance had been in place until about a year ago requiring documentation of historic buildings, where property owners had to apply for demolition permits. He stated a developer challenged the ordinance in court, and the judge overturned it. Dr. Mabry clarified it was a very narrow ruling issued by the judge, which was that it should not be in the *Building Code*, but rather in the *Land Use Code*. He stated the Mayor and Council directed him to work with the City Attorney to bring this ordinance back into the *Land Use Code* for adoption.

Dr. Mabry said they worked to streamline the ordinance, so that it would not be an ownerous process for property owners. Applications for demolition permits of buildings that were partly or entirely fifty years old or more would be required to provide architectural documentation so that there would be a record of the buildings and that they would not disappear without a trace. The ordinance would only apply to buildings that were either listed in the National Register or met the eligibility requirements.

Dr. Mabry stated the proposed ordinance would be brought to the Mayor and Council after it is reviewed by the Planning Commission, as it would be an amendment to the *Land Use Code*. The timeline to get the ordinance to the Planning Commission was in October. Dr. Mabry clarified that the proposed ordinance would not prevent demolition of old buildings; it would only require the extra step of architectural documentation.

Dr. Mabry asked for the Commission's support to add this requirement to the amendment to the *Land Use Code*. Dr. Mabry responded to questions from Commission members, and discussion was held.

Chair Majewski asked Dr. Mabry to provide the wording for the proposed ordinance to Clerk staff, who will email it to the Commission members for their review.

9. Tucson Preservation Foundation Update (Demion Clinco)

Commissioner Clinco reported that in coordination with the diocese and Dr. Mabry, the Tucson Preservation Foundation had completed a draft National Register nomination for the Marist College. He also gave an update on the Matus House.

10. City's Plans for the Old Tamarisk Trees next to the City IT Building (Jonathan Mabry)

Dr. Mabry gave a brief introduction regarding the City's plans for the old tamarisk trees located along the south side of the City's IT Building and the serious safety issue they presented. He said they were old trees with historic value and part of the historic landscaping of the grounds at the Manning House.

City of Tucson Urban Landscape Manager Irene Ogata gave a presentation, which included safety and welfare issues of the trees. She provided a brief background on the work that began about three years ago by the Landscape Advisory Committee when they saw that the trees had been mistreated by the way they were cut, and submitted pictures of the trees showing how they had been topped. The pictures submitted showed comparisons between the weak condition of the trees next to the IT Building and healthy tamarisk trees in El Encanto. From a safety standpoint issue, she stated the tamarisk trees by the IT Building, had already been compromised, and were a liability to the City.

Ms. Ogata introduced three representatives from the Landscape Advisory Committee, who were certified arborists - Elizabeth Davison, Kathryn Hahne, and Paula Smith - who agreed that the trees were a danger and were in a weak state.

Ms. Ogata stated the City Manager asked them to get an outside opinion. She said she asked for the opinion of Marana Parks and Recreation Director Tom Ellis, who is also a certified arborist. Ms. Ogata distributed a copy of an email from Mr. Ellis, where he indicated there were visible signs of limbs shearing from the main trunks, and the trunks showed signs of crack and decay. Ms. Ogata said Mr. Ellis recommended the trees be removed.

Ms. Ogata stated she spoke with Ken Scoville about a state program where great trees and heritage trees could be nominated. She obtained an evaluation on the tamarisk trees to see if they could be nominated as a great tree of Arizona. She was advised that the trees would not be eligible because they had already been compromised.

Ms. Ogata stated she recommended to Information Technology Director Ann Strine that if the trees had to come down they needed to be replaced. An agreement was made to replace the sixteen trees with sixteen trees. Ms. Ogata said her recommendation was to replace the tamarisk trees with native trees. However, if the historic context of the tamarisk trees was important, the option would be to replace the trees with tamarisk trees.

Chair Majewski asked the landscape architects on the Commission (Stephen Grede and Patsy Waterfall) what their thoughts were on the issue.

Commissioner Grede said the location, spacing, and relationship to a larger site would be extremely important, even more so than a specific species. His recommendation would be to consider those issues.

Commissioner Waterfall said it was difficult for her to say the trees should be removed, but that was her recommendation. She commented that it would be ideal from a historical perspective to replace the trees with tamarisk trees, but asked how the Commission could be assured that the trees would not be pruned incorrectly again.

Ms. Ogata responded to questions from Commission members and those in attendance, and discussion was held.

Chair Majewski suggested that when a plan is agreed to on replacement for the tamarisk trees, the plan should come before the Plans Review Subcommittee for a courtesy review.

Ken Scoville gave a brief presentation on the Manning House, and showed slides of the area as it appeared in the 1960s.

Dr. Mabry reported that the Landscape Advisory Committee recommended the trees be taken down because of safety issues. He added that the Landscape Advisory Committee did not evaluate the historic value of the trees, so he felt it was important for the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission to look at the historic value of the trees and weigh the safety issues and historic values. He asked for the Commission's recommendation.

It was moved by Commissioner Lyons, duly seconded, and carried by a voice vote of 14 to 0 (Commissioner Grede departed at 1:15 p.m., Commissioner Joaquin departed at 1:25 p.m., and Commissioners Brooke, Mackey, Rodriguez, RedDog, and Warshaw absent), to support the demolition of the old tamarisk trees next to the City's Information Technology Building, and that the plans for planting replacement trees come before the Plans Review Subcommittee for their review.

11. Commissioners' Summary of Current Events

No report was given.

12. Call to the Audience

Randy Van Nostrand, President, Valley of the Moon, asked the Commission if they had any additional recommendations for Valley of the Moon. He stated, at this time, they were not planning to move ahead with pursuing city landmark status for Valley of the Moon, but wanted to know if the Commission had any other recommendations for them.

Chair Majewski advised Mr. Van Nostrand that the Commission could not make a recommendation at this time, because the topic had not been agendaized for the current meeting. She asked Commissioners to contact Mr. Van Nostrand directly if they had any suggestions.

13. Future Agenda Items for October 2009 Meeting

Chair Majewski asked Commission members and staff to get future agenda items to her by the end of September.

14. Adjournment: 1:41 p.m.